Software Product Lines: Reuse That Makes Business Sense

Linda Northrop

ASWEC 2006
Software pervades every sector.

Software has become the bottom line for many organizations who never envisioned themselves in the software business.
UNIVERSAL NEEDS

- Deploy new products (services) at a rapid pace
- Accommodate a growing demand for new product features across a wide spectrum of feature categories
- Connect products in increasingly unprecedented ways
- Exploit a rapidly changing technology base
- Gain a competitive edge
UNIVERSAL BUSINESS GOALS

- High Quality
- Quick Time to Market
- Effective Use of Limited Resources
- Product Alignment
- Low Cost Production
- Low Cost Maintenance
- Mass Customization
- Mind Share

Improved Efficiency & Productivity
THE ULTIMATE UNIVERSAL GOAL

SUBSTANTIAL

QUICK

SUSTAINABLE

PROFIT
SOFTWARE (SYSTEM) STRATEGIES

PROCESS IMPROVEMENT

TECHNOLOGY INNOVATION

REUSE
Most organizations produce families of similar systems, differentiated by features.
Focus was small-grained and opportunistic. Results fell short of expectations.
BUT WHAT IS REUSE?

REUSE MEANS TAKING SOMETHING DEVELOPED FOR ONE SYSTEM AND USING IT IN ANOTHER.

“The Army XYZ System is built with 80% reuse.”

A statement like this is vacuous.

• It is not clear what is being reused.
• It is not clear that the “reuse” has any benefit.

Reusing code or components without an architecture focus and without pre-planning results in

• short-term perceived win
• long-term costs and problems
SOFTWARE REUSE FACT AND FICTION

THE FICTION:

“... and then we’ll be able to construct software systems by picking out parts and plugging them together, just like Tinkertoys ...”

THE FACT:

“It’s more like having a bathtub full of Tinkertoys, Legos, Erector Set parts, Lincoln Logs, Block City, and six other incompatible kits -- picking out parts that fit specific functions and expecting them to fit together.”
IMAGINE STRATEGIC REUSE

BUSINESS STRATEGY

TECHNICAL STRATEGY

STRATEGIC REUSE
CELSIUSTECH: SHIP SYSTEM 2000

A FAMILY OF 55 SHIP SYSTEMS

- Integration test of 1-1.5 million
- SLOC requires 1-2 people.
- Rehosting to a new platform/OS takes 3 months.
- Cost and schedule targets are predictably met.
- Performance/distribution behavior are known in advance.
- Customer satisfaction is high.
- Hardware-to-software cost ratio changed from 35:65 to 80:20.
CUMMINS INC.: DIESEL CONTROL SYSTEMS

OVER 20 PRODUCT GROUPS WITH OVER 1,000 SEPARATE ENGINE APPLICATIONS

- Product cycle time was slashed from 250 person-months to a few person-months.
- Build and integration time was reduced from one year to one week.
- Quality goals are exceeded.
- Customer satisfaction is high.
- Product schedules are met.
NATIONAL RECONNAISSANCE OFFICE/RAYTHEON: CONTROL CHANNEL TOOLKIT

GROUND-BASED SPACECRAFT COMMAND AND CONTROL SYSTEMS

- increased quality by 10X
- incremental build time reduced from months to weeks
- software productivity increased by 7X
- development time and costs decreased by 50%
- decreased product risk
MARKET MAKER GMBH: MERGER

INTERNET-BASED STOCK MARKET SOFTWARE

- Each product is “uniquely” configured.
- Putting up a customized system takes three days.
NOKIA MOBILE PHONES

PRODUCT LINES WITH 25-30 NEW PRODUCTS PER YEAR

Across products there are

- varying number of keys
- varying display sizes
- varying sets of features
- 58 languages supported
- 130 countries served
- multiple protocols
- needs for backwards compatibility
- configurable features
- needs for product behavior
- change after release
HOW DID THEY DO IT?
REUSE HISTORY: FROM AD HOC TO SYSTEMATIC

1960s SUBROUTINES
1970s MODULES
1980s OBJECTS
1990s COMPONENTS
2000s SOFTWARE PRODUCT LINES
WHAT IS A SOFTWARE PRODUCT LINE?

A software product line is a set of software-intensive systems sharing a common, managed set of features that satisfy the specific needs of a particular market segment or mission and that are developed from a common set of core assets in a prescribed way.
Product lines
• take economic advantage of commonality
• bound variability
HOW DO PRODUCT LINES HELP?

PRODUCT LINES AMORTIZE THE INVESTMENT IN THESE AND OTHER CORE ASSETS:

- requirements and requirements analysis
- domain model
- software architecture and design
- performance engineering
- documentation
- test plans, test cases, and test data
- people: their knowledge and skills
- processes, methods, and tools
- budgets, schedules, and work plans
- Components

PRODUCT LINES = STRATEGIC REUSE
THE KEY CONCEPTS

Use of a core asset base in production of a related set of products
THE KEY CONCEPTS

Use of a core asset base
in production
of a related set of products

Architecture
Production Plan
Scope Definition Business Case
SOFTWARE PRODUCT LINES ARE NOT

FORTUITOUS SMALL-GRAINED REUSE
  • reuse libraries containing algorithms, modules, objects, or components

SINGLE-SYSTEM DEVELOPMENT WITH REUSE
  • borrowing opportunistically from previous efforts
  • modifying code as necessary for the single system only

JUST COMPONENT-BASED DEVELOPMENT
  • selecting components from an in-house library or the marketplace with no architecture focus

JUST A CONFIGURABLE ARCHITECTURE
  • a good start, but only part of the reuse potential

JUST A SET OF TECHNICAL STANDARDS
  • constraining choices without an architecture-based reuse strategy
PRODUCT LINES ARE

Software product lines involve strategic, planned reuse that yields predictable results.
COMMERCIAL EXAMPLES

SUCCESSFUL SOFTWARE PRODUCT LINES HAVE BEEN BUILT FOR FAMILIES OF

- mobile phones
- command and control ship systems
- ground-based spacecraft systems
- avionics systems
- command and control/situation awareness systems
- pagers
- engine control systems
- billing systems
- web-based retail systems
- printers
- consumer electronic products
- acquisition management enterprise systems
- financial and tax systems
- medical devices
REAL WORLD MOTIVATION

ORGANIZATIONS USE PRODUCT LINE PRACTICES TO:

- achieve large scale productivity gains
- improve time to market
- maintain market presence
- sustain unprecedented growth
- compensate for an inability to hire
- achieve systematic reuse goals
- improve product quality
- increase customer satisfaction
- enable mass customization
- get control of diverse product configurations
- achieve greater market agility
SUMMARY: ORGANIZATIONAL BENEFITS

IMPROVED PRODUCTIVITY
• by as much as 10x

DECREASED TIME TO MARKET (TO FIELD, TO LAUNCH...)
• by as much as 10x

DECREASED COST
• by as much as 60%

DECREASED LABOR NEEDS
• by as much as 10X fewer software developers

INCREASED QUALITY
• by as much as 10X fewer defects

Product line practice permits predictable “faster, better, cheaper.”
## COSTS OF A SOFTWARE PRODUCT LINE

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Core Assets</th>
<th>Costs</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Architecture</td>
<td>Must support variation inherent in the product line</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Software Components</td>
<td>Must be designed to be general without a loss of performance; must build in support for variation points</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Test Plans, Test Cases, Test Data</td>
<td>Must consider variation points and multiple instances of the product line</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Business Case and Market Analysis</td>
<td>Must address a family of software products, not just one product</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Project Plans</td>
<td>Must be generic or be made extensible to accommodate product variations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tools and Processes</td>
<td>Must be more robust</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>People, Skills, Training</td>
<td>Must involve training and expertise centered around the assets and procedures associated with the product line</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
ECONOMICS OF PRODUCT LINES

Software Product-Line Engineering: A Family-Based Software Development Process
ECONOMICS OF PRODUCT LINES

Software Product-Line Engineering: A Family-Based Software Development Process
NECESSARY CHANGES

The product line architecture is the foundation of everything.
WHY IS SOFTWARE ARCHITECTURE IMPORTANT?

- Represents *earliest* design decisions
- *First* design artifact addressing
- Key to systematic *reuse*

- Hardest to change
- Most critical to get right
- Communication vehicle among stakeholders
- Performance
- Modifiability
- Reliability
- Security
- Transferable, reusable abstraction

The **right architecture** paves the way for system **success**. The **wrong architecture** usually spells some form of **disaster**.
PRODUCT LINE PRACTICE

CONTEXTS FOR PRODUCT LINES VARY WIDELY, BASED ON

- nature of products
- nature of market or mission
- business goals
- organizational infrastructure
- workforce distribution
- process discipline
- artifact maturity

But there are universal essential activities and practices.
THE SEI FRAMEWORK FOR SOFTWARE PRODUCT LINE PRACTICE℠

The SEI Framework for Software Product Line Practice is a conceptual framework that describes the essential activities and twenty-nine practice areas necessary for successful software product lines.

The Framework, originally conceived in 1998, is evolving based on the experience and information provided by the community.

Version 4.0 – in *Software Product Lines: Practices and Patterns*

SEI INFORMATION SOURCES

Case studies, experience reports, and surveys

Workshops and conferences

Applied research

Collaborations with customers on actual product lines
THE THREE ESSENTIAL ACTIVITIES

- Core Asset Development
- Product Development
- Management
CORE ASSET DEVELOPMENT

Product Constraints
Production Constraints
Production Strategy
Inventory of Pre-existing Assets
Core Asset Development
Management
Product Line Scope
Core Assets
Production Plan
ATTACHED PROCESSES

Core Assets

Core Asset Development

Attached Processes

Management

Core Asset Base

Production Plan
PRODUCT DEVELOPMENT

- Product Requirements
- Product Line Scope
- Core Assets
- Production Plan

Product Development
Management

Products

© 2006 Carnegie Mellon University
PRODUCT DEVELOPMENT

Product Requirements
Product Line Scope
Core Assets
Production Plan

Product Development
Management

Products
MANAGEMENT
MANAGEMENT

MANAGEMENT AT MULTIPLE LEVELS PLAYS A CRITICAL ROLE IN THE SUCCESSFUL PRODUCT LINE PRACTICE BY

• achieving the right organizational structure
• allocating resource
• coordinating and supervising
• providing training
• rewarding employees appropriately
• developing and communicating an acquisition strategy
• managing external interfaces
• creating and implementing a product line adoption plan
• launching and institutionalizing the approach in a manner appropriate to the organization
MANAGING A SOFTWARE PRODUCT LINE REQUIRES LEADERSHIP

A KEY ROLE FOR A SOFTWARE PRODUCT LINE MANAGER IS THAT OF CHAMPION.

The champion must

- set and maintain the vision
- ensure that the appropriate goals and measures are in place
- “sell” the product line up and down the chain
- sustain morale
- deflect potential derailments
- solicit feedback and continuously improve the approach
Each of these is essential, as is the blending of all three.
DIFFERENT APPROACHES - 1

PROACTIVE: DEVELOP THE CORE ASSETS FIRST.

- Develop the scope first and use it as a “mission” statement.
- Products come to market quickly with minimum code writing.
- requires upfront investment and predictive knowledge

REACTIVE: START WITH ONE OR MORE PRODUCTS.

- From them, generate the product line core assets and then future products; the scope evolves more dramatically.
- much lower cost of entry
- The architecture and other core assets must be robust, extensible, and appropriate to future product line needs.
DIFFERENT APPROACHES - 2

INCREMENTAL:

In either a reactive or proactive approach, it is possible to develop the core asset base in stages, while planning from the beginning to develop a product line.

- Develop part of the core asset base, including the architecture and some of the components.
- Develop one or more products.
- Develop part of the rest of the core asset base.
- Develop more products.
- Evolve more of the core asset base.
- ...

## ALTERNATE TERMINOLOGY

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>OUR TERMINOLOGY</th>
<th>ALTERNATE TERMINOLOGY</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Product Line</td>
<td>Product Family</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Core Assets</td>
<td>Platform</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Business Unit</td>
<td>Product Line</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Product</td>
<td>Customization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Core Asset Development</td>
<td>Domain Engineering</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Product Development</td>
<td>Application Engineering</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
DRIVING THE ESSENTIAL ACTIVITIES

BENEATH THE LEVEL OF THE ESSENTIAL ACTIVITIES ARE ESSENTIAL PRACTICES THAT FALL INTO PRACTICE AREAS.

A practice area is a body of work or a collection of activities that an organization must master to successfully carry out the essential work of a product line.
PRACTICE AREAS CATEGORIES

Software Engineering
Technical Management
Organizational Management
RELATIONSHIPS AMONG CATEGORIES OF PRACTICE AREAS

Software Engineering Practice Areas

Technical Management Practice Areas

Organizational Management Practice Areas

manage and support

enable and orchestrate
## PRACTICE AREAS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Software Engineering</th>
<th>Technical Management</th>
<th>Organizational Management</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Architecture Definition</td>
<td>Configuration Management</td>
<td>Building a Business Case</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Architecture Evaluation</td>
<td>Data Collection, Metrics, and Tracking</td>
<td>Customer Interface Management</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Component Development</td>
<td>Make/Buy/Mine/Commission Analysis</td>
<td>Developing an Acquisition Strategy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>COTS Utilization</td>
<td>Process Definition</td>
<td>Funding</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mining Existing Assets</td>
<td>Scoping</td>
<td>Launching and Institutionalizing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Requirements Engineering</td>
<td>Technical Planning</td>
<td>Market Analysis</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Software System Integration</td>
<td>Technical Risk Management</td>
<td>Operations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Testing</td>
<td>Tool Support</td>
<td>Organizational Planning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Understanding Relevant Domains</td>
<td></td>
<td>Organizational Risk Management</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Structuring the Organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Technology Forecasting</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Training</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
DILEMMA: HOW DO YOU APPLY THE 29 PRACTICE AREAS?

ORGANIZATIONS STILL HAVE TO FIGURE OUT HOW TO PUT THE PRACTICE AREAS INTO PLAY.

Twenty-nine is a big number.
HELP TO MAKE IT HAPPEN
HELP TO MAKE IT HAPPEN

ESSENTIAL ACTIVITIES

PRACTICE AREAS

Software Engineering  Technical Management  Organizational Management

GUIDANCE

Case Studies  Patterns  Probe

Software Engineering Institute  Carnegie Mellon

© 2006 Carnegie Mellon University
HELP TO MAKE IT HAPPEN

ESSENTIAL ACTIVITIES

PRACTICE AREAS

Software Engineering | Technical Management | Organizational Management

GUIDANCE

Case Studies | Patterns | Probe
PATTERNS CAN HELP

- Patterns are a way of expressing common context and problem-solution pairs.

- Patterns have been found to be useful in building architecture, economics, software architecture, software design, software implementation, process improvement, and others.

- Patterns assist in effecting a divide and conquer approach.
SOFTWARE PRODUCT LINE PRACTICE PATTERN

**Organizational Situation**

**What part of a product line effort needs to be accomplished**

**Grouping of practice areas**

**Relations among these practice areas (and/or groups if there is more than one)**
WHAT TO BUILD PATTERN - 1

NAME:

The *What to Build* pattern helps an organization determine what products ought to be in its software product line – what products to build.

CONTEXT:

An organization has decided to field a software product line and knows the general product area for the set of products.
WHAT TO BUILD PATTERN - 2

Dynamic Structure
FACTORY PATTERN - 1

NAME:

The Factory pattern is a composite pattern that describes the entire product line organization.

CONTEXT:

An organization is considering (or fielding) a product line.
FACTORY PATTERN - 2

Dynamic Structure
# CURRENT SET OF PATTERNS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Pattern</th>
<th>Variants</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Assembly Line</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cold Start</td>
<td>Warm Start</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Curriculum</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Each Asset</td>
<td>Each Asset Apprentice Evolve Each Asset</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Essentials Coverage</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Factory</td>
<td>Adoption Factory</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In Motion</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Monitor</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Process</td>
<td>Process Improvement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Product Parts</td>
<td>Green Field Barren Field Plowed Field</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What to Build</td>
<td>Analysis Forced March</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
THE ADOPTION ENDGAME

EFFECTIVELY ACHIEVE AN OPERATIONAL PRODUCT LINE.

• have
  • a core asset base
  • supportive processes and organizational structures
• develop products from that asset base in a way that achieves business goals
• improve and extend the software product line adoption effort as long as it makes sense
BARRIERS TO PRODUCT LINE ADOPTION

Cost, cost, & cost....
You have to invest to eventually SAVE.
BARRIERS TO PRODUCT LINE ADOPTION
THE ADOPTION FACTORY PATTERN

Establish Context

Establish Production Capability

Operate Product Line

Product

What to Build

Product Parts

Product Builder

Process

Process Definition

Assembly Line

Organization

Cold Start

In Motion

Monitor

Informs
## ASSOCIATED PRACTICE AREAS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Establish Context</th>
<th>Establish Production Capability</th>
<th>Operate Product Line</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Product</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Marketing Analysis</td>
<td>• Requirements Engineering</td>
<td>• Requirements Engineering</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Understanding Relevant Domains</td>
<td>• Architecture Definition</td>
<td>• Architecture Definition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Technology Forecasting</td>
<td>• Architecture Evaluation</td>
<td>• Architecture Evaluation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Building a Business Case</td>
<td>• Mining Existing Assets</td>
<td>• Mining Existing Assets</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Scoping</td>
<td>• Component Development</td>
<td>• Component Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• COTS Utilization</td>
<td>• COTS Utilization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Software System Integration</td>
<td>• Software System Integration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Testing</td>
<td>• Testing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Process</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Process Definition</td>
<td>• Make/Buy/Mine/Commission</td>
<td>• Make/Buy/Mine/Commission</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Configuration Management</td>
<td>• Configuration Management</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Tool Support</td>
<td>• Tool Support</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Data Collection, Metrics, Tracking</td>
<td>• Data Collection, Metrics, Tracking</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Technical Planning</td>
<td>• Technical Planning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Technical Risk Management</td>
<td>• Technical Risk Management</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Organization</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Launching and Institutionalizing</td>
<td>• Launching and Institutionalizing</td>
<td>• Data Collection, Metrics and Tracking</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Funding</td>
<td>• Funding</td>
<td>• Technical Risk Management</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Structuring the Organization</td>
<td>• Structuring the Organization</td>
<td>• Organizational Risk Management</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Operations</td>
<td>• Operations</td>
<td>• Customer Interface Management</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Organizational Planning</td>
<td>• Organizational Planning</td>
<td>• Organizational Planning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Customer Interface Management</td>
<td>• Customer Interface Management</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Organizational Risk Management</td>
<td>• Organizational Risk Management</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Developing an Acquisition Strategy</td>
<td>• Developing an Acquisition Strategy</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Training</td>
<td>• Training</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
IN A NUTSHELL

• Software product lines epitomize the concept of strategic, planned reuse.

• The product line concept is about more than a new technology. It is a new way of doing one’s software business.

• There are essential product line activities and practices areas as well as product line patterns to make the move to product lines more manageable.
WHAT’S DIFFERENT ABOUT REUSE WITH SOFTWARE PRODUCT LINES?

• Business dimension

• Iteration

• Architecture focus

• Preplanning

• Process and product connection
AT THE HEART OF SUCCESSFUL PRODUCT LINES

- A pressing need that addresses the heart of the business
- Long and deep domain experience
- A legacy base from which to build
- Architectural excellence
- Process discipline
- Management commitment
- Loyalty to the product line as a single entity
FINAL WORD

If properly managed, the benefits of a product line approach far exceed the costs.

Strategic software reuse through a well-managed product line approach achieves business goals for:

- efficiency
- time to market
- productivity
- quality
- agility
QUESTIONS – NOW OR LATER

Linda Northrop
Director, Product Line Systems Program
Telephone: 412-268-7638
Email: lmn@sei.cmu.edu

U.S. Mail:
Software Engineering Institute
Carnegie Mellon University
4500 Fifth Avenue
Pittsburgh, PA 15213-3890

World Wide Web:
http://www.sei.cmu.edu/productlines/plp_init.html

SEI Fax: 412-268-5758